RESEARCH ARTICLE



Greenhouse gas emissions reduction utilizing methaneoxidizing bacteria in critical growth stages of paddy

Terry Ayu Adriany¹, Nourma Al Viandari¹, Etty Pratiwi¹, Alina Akhdiya¹, Syaiful Anwar², Ali Pramono³, Elisabeth Srihayu Harsanti¹, Asep Nugraha Ardiwinata¹, Mas Teddy Sutriadi¹, and Anicetus Wihardjaka^{1*}

¹Research Organization for Agriculture and Food, National Research and Innovation Agency, Cibinong Science Center, Bogor, Indonesia.

²IPB University, Faculty of Agriculture, Department of Soil Science and Land Resources, Bogor, Indonesia.

³Indonesian Agricultural Environment Standardization Institute, Indonesian Agency for Agricultural Instrument Standardization, Pati, Indonesia.

*Corresponding author (anic001@brin.go.id).

Received: 13 September 2024; Accepted: 2 December 2024, doi:10.4067/S0718-58392025000300359

ABSTRACT

Paddy cultivation contributes to greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions in the agricultural sector. The consistency of the biological option to reduce GHG emissions is utilizing methane-oxidizing bacteria in paddy cultivation. This study aimed to obtain methane (CH₄) and nitrous oxide (N₂O) reduction by applying methane-oxidizing bacteria in soil incubation and the critical growth stages of paddy in paddy fields. The research was conducted at the greenhouse gas laboratory for soil incubation with four isolates (*Amorphomonas oryzae* (SI5), *Ciceribacter* sp. (OF4), *Rhodanobacter rhizosphaerae* (TH6), *Bordetella petrii* (BD4)), and combination bacterial consortium at the paddy field scale. The treatment consisted of applying bacterial consortium and organic matter at the field scale. The first factor: R0 = without bacterial application; R1 = SI5, OF4, BD4; R2 = SI5, TH6, OF4; R3 = SI5, BD4, *Priestia aryabhattai*. The second factor was organic matter addition; O0 = without manure and O1 = 2 t ha⁻¹ farmyard manure. Applying four isolates had a positive effect in reducing N₂O and CH₄ concentrations in soil incubation. The SI5 reduced CH₄ concentration by 22%, and BD4 showed a 22% N₂O reduction during soil incubation. The bacterial consortium R3 was the best treatment to reduce total CH₄ and N₂O emissions at three critical growth stages of paddy and produced the highest total population of methanotrophs and denitrifying bacteria. Bacterial consortia are suggested as a potential strategy for promoting sustainable agriculture and environment.

Key words: CH₄ emission, denitrifying bacteria, methane-oxidizing bacteria, N₂O emission, paddy field.

INTRODUCTION

Paddy fields are emitters of greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions, as well as methane (CH₄), nitrous oxide (N₂O), and carbon dioxide (CO₂), which are released into the atmosphere. The primary GHG emissions in paddy fields are CH₄ and N₂O (Pham et al., 2021). Rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) cultivation contributes 30% and 11% of CH₄ and N₂O emissions from agriculture, respectively (Gupta et al., 2021). Methane is emitted by the anaerobic decomposition of organic matter and the presence of methanogenic archaea in the soil. Nitrous oxide is also released during denitrification processes in the soil due to fertilization. Increasing CH₄ and N₂O emissions are influenced by various factors, such as water regime, organic matter amendment, soil temperature, soil moisture, fertilizer application, and rice varieties (Gupta et al., 2021; Pramono et al., 2024).

Paddy plays a crucial role in the release of GHG emissions in paddy fields. The total CH₄ emissions from the soil are released into the atmosphere through aerenchyma. Aerenchyma is found in the stems and roots of paddy and acts as chimneys for releasing CH₄ into the atmosphere (lqbal et al., 2023). The optimum conditions for the formation of CH₄ in paddy fields are continuous flooding irrigation systems, limited oxygen (anaerobic condition), and low redox potential in the soil. The CH₄ is produced by methane-producing archaea that utilize

C sources, such as CO₂, methyl alcohol (CH₃OH), and acetate (CH₃COOH), as energy sources in the metabolic process under anoxic soil conditions (Wang et al., 2021b).

One mitigation option to reduce CH₄ emissions in paddy fields is the application of methane-oxidizing bacteria (MOB), which are known as methanotrophs. These bacteria utilize CH₄ as a C source in their metabolic processes, significantly reducing CH₄ emissions in paddy fields. The bacteria have genes to encode the enzyme methane monooxygenase (MMO), which catalyzes CH₄ into CO₂ and H₂O under aerobic conditions (Wang et al., 2021b). Davamani et al. (2020) reported that applying bacterial consortium with methanotrophic, N-fixing, and phosphate-solubilizing bacteria reduced CH₄ emissions by 60% and improved rice yields by 35%.

Rice cultivation activities are closely related to applying N fertilizers to enhance crop production. Nitrogen is an essential macro element for plant growth, where its availability determines crop yield (Ye et al., 2022). However, N fertilizer is also a significant source of N₂O emissions into the atmosphere. More than two-thirds of N₂O emissions come from nitrification and denitrification by bacteria and fungi in the soil, primarily due to N fertilizer application (Pan et al., 2022). Moreover, increasing the N fertilizer rate also increased atmospheric CH₄ emissions. Several studies have indicated that applying N, P, and K fertilizers can stimulate CH₄ production, as indicated by increased *mcrA* methanogen gene expression (Zhang et al., 2018). Reducing N input into the soil is an option to reduce N₂O emissions, but it may also reduce crop productivity. An alternative option is the application of bacteria that reduces nitrate to N₂ by producing nitrate-, nitrite-, and nitrous oxide reductase, which could reduce N₂O emissions (Jonassen et al., 2021).

Increasing the population of MOB and denitrifying bacteria in paddy fields can reduce GHG emissions by converting CH₄ and N₂O into less harmful gases. Preliminary research has carried out the isolation of Indigenous MOB at three rice agroecosystems (Adriany et al., 2021). Three rice agroecosystems have some isolates to potentially reduce CH₄ and N₂O fluxes in paddy soils, namely isolate from technically irrigated paddy fields (SI5), rice organic farming (OF4), and rainfed paddy fields (TH6). Another isolate, BD4, is an aerobic bacterium that was isolated from a slurry of biodigester. *Priestia aryabhattai*, which was previously known as *Bacillus aryabhattai* (Gupta et al., 2020), increases crop production. These four isolates were used in this research. The objective was to identify and evaluate GHG emissions reduction by utilizing MOB in soil incubation in the critical growth stages of paddy.

MATERIAL AND METHODS

Experimental site

The experiment was conducted at the Agricultural Experimental Station of Indonesian Agricultural Environmental Standardization Institute, in Sidomukti village (6°46'39.7" S, 111°11'53.0" E; Figure 1), Jaken subdistrict, Pati Regency, Central Java Province, Indonesia. The research started from March to September 2021.

Soil incubation

The four isolates, *Amorphomonas oryzae* (SI5), *Ciceribacter* sp. (OF4), *Rhodanobacter rhizosphaerae* (TH6), and *Bordetella petrii* (BD4), were cultured in NMS (liquid) + methanol to test their ability to oxidize methane (CH₄) and reduce nitrous oxide (N₂O) concentrations. For the experiment, 25 g sterile dry soil, 10 mL liquid medium nitrate minimal salts (NMS) without methanol, 30 mL sterile distilled water, urea 180 kg N ha⁻¹, 1 mL each isolate 10^{6} CFU mL⁻¹, and CH₄ standard 11.52 mg kg⁻¹ were added into an incubation bottle. The headspace settings were adjusted to a composition of 50% CH₄:50% air in the bottle. The control was without the addition of bacteria. The incubation was accomplished for 15 d with a 150 rpm shaker at room temperature. The CH₄ and N₂O concentration was measured at 2, 5, 7, 10, and 15 d during incubation by taking 5 mL gas in the bottle using a 5 mL syringe. The CH₄ and N₂O concentrations were analyzed using gas chromatography (GC) (GC-2014; Shimadzu, Kyoto, Japan). The percentage reduction of CH₄ and N₂O concentrations was calculated by comparing the control concentration with the concentration for each isolate as follows:

$$R = \frac{[C] - [T]}{[C]} \times 100\%$$

where R is the percentage reduction of CH_4 or N_2O , [C] is the concentration of control treatment, and [T] is the concentration of treatment CH_4 or N_2O .



Figure 1. Experimental site at Sidomukti village, Jaken sub-district, Pati Regency, Central Java Province, Indonesia.

Rice cultivation and greenhouse gas (GHG) measurement

The treatments were conducted using a randomized block design, with two factors (bacterial consortium and organic matter) and three replicates. The treatment code for the first factor was the application of bacterial consortium: RO = without bacterial consortium application; R1 = SI5, OF4, BD4; R2 = SI5, TH6, OF4; R3 = SI5, BD4, *Priestia aryabhattai*. The second factor was the application of organic matter: OO = without manure and O1 = 2 t ha⁻¹ farmyard manure. The nutrient content in farmyard manure was organic C 14.95%, total N 0.62%, C/N ratio of 24, total P 8.61%, total K 7.59%, and pH 8.21.

Land preparation consisted of plowing, leveling, and harrowing. A plot with the size of 6×6 m was used as an experimental unit. The rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) 'Inpari 32' was used with a seedling age of 15 d after sowing. The bacterial consortium was applied at three stages: Seed treatment, vegetative phase at 30 d after transplanting (DAT), and generative phase at the beginning of flowering primordia at 55 DAT. The bacterial consortium was applied during seed treatment by soaking plant seeds at 500 mL ha⁻¹, 10⁵ CFU mL⁻¹, dissolved in water in a ratio of 1:100 (v/v). The plant spacing used was 20 × 20 cm with 2-3 rice seedlings per hole. The bacterial consortium was applied at vegetative and early generative phases with a rate of 6 L ha⁻¹ and sprayed above the soil surface.

The inorganic fertilizers rates were 120 kg N, 45 kg P₂O₅, and 60 kg K₂O per hectare based on fertilization recommendations from the Integrated Cropping Calendar Information System of the Indonesian Ministry of Agriculture for paddy fields in Jaken sub-district, Pati Regency, Central Java, and preliminary soil analysis results. Fertilizer application was split at 7 DAT for the first fertilizer ($^{1}/_{3}$ N + $^{1}/_{3}$ K + P), 28 DAT for the second fertilizer, and 49 DAT for the third fertilizer ($^{1}/_{3}$ N + $^{1}/_{3}$ K, respectively). The irrigation system used continuous flooding with a water level of 5 cm in the soil surface to optimize GHG emissions from paddy fields. The climate data was recorded by an automatic weather station located near the experimental site. The average daily temperature and precipitation during rice plant growth are shown in Figure 2.

The CH₄ and N₂O fluxes were measured ten times using the closed chamber method during the rice growing season. The critical growth stages of paddy were 23 DAT active tillering/vegetative stage, 58 DAT maximum tillering/early generative stage, and 80 DAT seed ripening stage. In addition, the number of tillers and plant height were measured in these stages. The chamber was made of transparent plastic with a thickness of 0.8 mm and an aluminum frame with a size of $50 \times 50 \times 100$ cm to cover four clumps. The temperature changes in the chamber were recorded at each sampling interval of 0, 10, 20, 30, and 40 min. The concentrations of CH₄ and N₂O gases were analyzed using GC-2014. The daily fluxes or emissions (Q) of CH₄ and N₂O released from one area of the paddy field were calculated based on the equation (Win et al., 2021) as follows:

$$\mathbf{Q} = \frac{\Delta \mathbf{c}}{\Delta \mathbf{t}} \times \frac{\mathbf{V}}{\mathbf{A}} \times \frac{\mathbf{M}}{22.4} \times \frac{273}{\mathbf{K}}$$

where Q is CH₄ or N₂O flux (mg m⁻² min⁻¹), $\Delta c/\Delta t$ is the rate of change of gas concentration per unit time (mg kg⁻¹ min⁻¹), V is the chamber volume (m³), A is the chamber area (m²), M is the molecular weight of CH₄ or N₂O (g), 22.4 L is the molecular volume at standard temperature and pressure, K is Kelvin temperature of the air temperature inside the chamber.



Figure 2. Daily precipitations, maximum and minimum temperatures during rice growing season.

Soil parameter

The soil sample in the experimental site was categorized in the order Inceptisols, silt loam, and subgroup Aeric Endoaquepts. Physicochemical properties for soil nutrients, pH, and soil texture before planting are shown in Table 1. Soil analysis was conducted directly after taking samples at the soil testing laboratory Indonesian Agricultural Environmental Standardization Institute. The soil samples were labeled as initial soil and post-harvesting after applying treatment. Soil fertility in the field experiment generally had a shallow C-organic, moderate total N and cation-exchange capacity, and high K and P content.

Parameters	Value	Method
Organic C, %	0.48	Walkey and Black
Total N, %	0.24	H ₂ SO ₄ , Titrimetric
N-NO3 ⁻ , mg kg ⁻¹	9.34	Morgan Wolf
N-NH4 ⁺ , mg kg ⁻¹	1.97	Morgan Wolf
Available P, mg kg ⁻¹	114.81	Bray
Available K, mg kg ⁻¹	41.99	Morgan Wolf
CEC, cmol ₍₊₎ kg ⁻¹	17.11	Ammonium Acetate
pН	5.70	H ₂ O (1:5)
Soil texture		Gravimetric
Clay, %	25.20	
Sand, %	44.50	
Silt, %	30.30	

Table 1. Physicochemical properties for initial soil. CEC: Cation-exchange capacity.

Methanotroph and denitrifying bacteria population

Methanotroph and denitrifying bacteria populations were calculated at three critical growth stages of paddy (23, 58, and 80 DAT). Soil sampling was conducted at a depth of 0-15 cm with a composite of five sample points diagonally on each plot. The calculation of soil bacterial population was conducted to determine the abundance of methanotrophs and denitrifying bacteria. The method of calculating the population of methanotrophs and denitrifying bacteria used the most probable number (MPN) (Davamani et al., 2020). The NMS + 1% methanol medium was used for methanotroph bacteria growth and nutrient broth (NB) + KNO₃ was used for denitrifying bacteria of tubes with positive results characterized by the formation of gas in the Durham tube. The number of bacterial populations was determined according to the MPN table.

Data analysis

The collected data were analyzed by ANOVA to determine the effect of differences between groups, treatments, and interactions of the two factors. The Tukey test at 5% significance level was used to identify significant differences between the treatments.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Characteristics and potential of bacteria

The result indicated that the four bacterial isolates (SI5, OF4, TH6, and BD4) had the potential to reduce CH_4 and N_2O emissions in paddy fields. The identification and characteristics of these bacterial isolates are shown in Table 2. The SI5 and OF4 have the ability for N_2 fixation and indole acetic acid (IAA) production. The BD4 and TH6 are classified as denitrifying bacteria.

No.	Isolate	Similarity (%)	Species name	Accession	Characteristics
1	SI5	99.93	Amorphomonas oryzae	AB233493.1	Gram-negative, aerobic, yellow-cream, bacillus, motile, N ₂ fixer, IAA- producing
2	OF4	99.93	<i>Ciceribacter</i> sp.	MH579729.1	Gram-negative, aerobic, dark brown, bacillus, motile, N ₂ fixer, IAA- producing
3	BD4	99.68	Bordetella petrii	EU082174.1	Gram-negative, aerobic, white-cream, bacillus, non- motile
4	TH6	99.93	Rhodanobacter rhizosphaerae	NR_156938.1	Gram-negative, aerobic, brown-yellow, bacillus, non-motile

Table 2. Identification and characteristics of bacteria were observed on NMS medium + methanol 1%, a selective medium for the growth of methanotrophic bacteria. IAA: Indole-3-acetic acid.

Amorphomonas oryzae (SI5) and Ciceribacter sp. (OF4) are groups of Gram-negative bacteria, Rhizobiaceae family, and non-symbiotic N₂ fixation (Yousuf et al., 2014; Siddiqi et al., 2018). Amorphomonas oryzae survives under neutral soil up to high salt concentrations (saline soil) and adapts to dry and stressful environmental conditions (Yousuf et al., 2014). Genus Ciceribacter grows in a wide pH range, as an N₂ fixer and positive catalase (Zhang et al., 2023). Rhodanobacter rhizosphaerae (TH6) is an aerobic bacterium. The genus Rhodanobacter, the class Gammaproteobacteria, is a denitrifying bacterium that is tolerant to lower pH conditions, rich in nitrate, and contaminated with heavy metals in soil (Prakash et al., 2021). Bordetella petrii (BD4) is the only species in the genus Bordetella found in environments that have encoding nitrate-, nitrite-, and nitrous oxide reductases genes, which play a crucial role in the denitrification process to convert nitrate into N₂O and N₂. It also has a monooxygenase enzyme for the degradation of aromatic compounds (Gross et al., 2008).

Reduction of CH4 and N2O concentrations in soil incubation

The ability to reduce CH₄ and N₂O concentrations was shown in percentages of CH₄ and N₂O reduction compared to the control treatment. Percentage reduction in CH₄ and N₂O concentrations from the four isolates with the addition of urea 180 kg N ha⁻¹ for 15 d incubation compared to control are shown in Figure 3. Four isolates and adding urea positive responded to reducing CH₄ and N₂O concentrations. The SI5 had the highest average decrease in CH₄ concentration by 22% for 15 d incubation. Moreover, TH6 had the lowest CH₄ concentration for 15 d incubation by 8%. Three isolates namely, *A. oryzae* (SI5), *Ciceribacter* sp. (OF4), and *B. petrii* (BD4), had a positive response in reducing N₂O concentration in sterile soil incubation. The highest reduction of N₂O concentration was BD4, with an average percentage of reduction of N₂O concentration by 22% for 15 d incubation. *Rhodanobacter rhizosphaerae* (TH6) did not give a response in reducing N₂O concentration during incubation.



Figure 3. Percentage reduction in CH_4 and N_2O concentrations during soil incubation with the addition of urea and four isolates.

Only three bacterial isolates, SI5, OF4, and BD4, simultaneously reduced CH₄ and N₂O concentrations, while only TH6 reduced CH₄ concentration singularly. However, these four bacterial isolates are not included in the 13 genera of methanotrophic bacteria known to have methane monooxygenase (MMO) enzymes that can oxidize methane. The addition of urea to the growth medium of methanotrophic bacteria affected the rate of methane oxidation. Wei et al. (2016) reported that applying more urea fertilizer will accelerate methane oxidation rate and stimulate methanotrophic activity.

The application of N-urea fertilizer enhances ammonium concentration and microorganism activities, such as those of methanotrophic bacteria. The bacteria utilize ammonium as a nutrient for their growth. When a large amount of N-ammonium is applied to the soil, it is used as the food source for methanotrophic bacteria. According to van Dijk et al. (2021), ammonia acts more as a nutrient than as an inhibitor when methane concentrations are high enough to support the growth rate of methanotrophic bacteria. The abundance of methane and oxygen in the soil also influenced the high and low rates of methane oxidation. High levels of methane and oxygen availability in the soil increased methane oxidation rates, effectively reducing methane emissions into the atmosphere (Nwokolo and Enebe, 2024).

Effect of bacterial consortium application on reducing GHG emissions in critical growth stages of paddy

The results showed that CH₄ fluxes in critical growth stages of paddy with the application of bacterial consortium had a significant effect at 23, 51, and 58 DAT (Table 3). The R3 bacterial consortium showed the lowest CH₄ flux by 337.56 mg CH₄ m⁻² d⁻¹ with a reduction of 17.6% compared to the control (without application) at 23 DAT. At 51 and 58 DAT, R2 and R3 bacterial consortium applications had low CH₄ fluxes. In the early generative stage (58 DAT), both consortia emitted 264.22 and 262.52 mg CH₄ m⁻² d⁻¹, reducing 26.7% and 27.1% compared to the control. The total CH₄ emission calculation from the application of bacterial consortium R3 emitted the lowest CH₄ emission by 217 kg ha⁻¹ season⁻¹ compared to the control (Table 5).

Table 3. Daily fluxes of CH₄ concentrations during the rice growing season. ^{ns}Nonsignificant, *p < 0.05; **p < 0.01; ***p < 0.001. Means followed by different letters within each group of values indicate significant differences (p < 0.05) within the same column by Tukey's test. SI5: *Amorphomonas oryzae*, OF4: *Ciceribacter* sp., TH6: *Rhodanobacter rhizosphaerae*, BD4: *Bordetella petrii*.

	CH_4 fluxes (mg CH_4 m ⁻² d ⁻¹)									
Treatments	9 DAT	16 DAT	23 DAT	30 DAT	37 DAT	51 DAT	58 DAT	65 DAT	72 DAT	80 DAT
Block										
1	169.38	260.97 ^{ab}	354.37 ^b	325.39 ^b	328.33 ^b	340.89	292.98 ^{ab}	281.88 ^b	212.89 ^b	249.14
2	236.65	192.48 ^b	340.79 ^{ab}	346.18 ^{ab}	350.45 ^b	331.89	264.67 ^b	301.79 ^b	315.39 ^{ab}	265.21
3	279.40	341.12ª	460.79ª	410.76ª	479.37ª	403.98	357.48ª	448.77ª	359.96ª	330.77
Bacterial consortium (R)										
R0 (without application)	243.82	276.05	409.80ª	367.95	379.12	449.95ª	360.33ª	407.36	290.30	357.10
R1 (SI5, OF4, BD4)	201.44	268.73	406.30 ^{ab}	386.51	406.53	376.92ªb	333.09 ^{ab}	375.33	339.91	237.84
R2 (SI5, TH6, OF4)	284.77	256.83	387.59 ^{ab}	360.39	388.06	309.88 ^b	264.22 ^b	286.85	329.73	262.81
R3 (SI5, BD4, Priestia aryabhattai)	183.87	257.57	337.56 ^b	328.24	370.49	298.93 ^b	262.52 ^b	307.04	224.39	269.07
Organic matter (O)										
O0 (without application)	235.81	250.16	381.64	371.05	370.47	398.67	325.94	333.70	304.76	290.29
O1 (2 t ha ⁻¹)	221.14	279.43	387.99	350.50	401.62	319.17	284.15	345.58	287.38	273.12
Pr > F										
Block	ns	**	***	*	**	ns	*	**	8	ns
Bacterial consortium (R)	ns	ns	*	ns	ns	*	*	ns	ns	ns
Organic matter (O)	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns
R×O	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns

The dynamics of daily N₂O fluxes are influenced by fertilization, soil conditions, and nutrient content in the soil. The N₂O fluxes at critical growth stages of paddy with the application of bacterial consortium showed significant effects at 58 and 80 DAT (Table 4). Bacterial consortium (R1, R2, or R3) showed the lowest N₂O flux at 58 DAT by 0.49, 0.72, and 0.57 mg N₂O m⁻² d⁻¹, decreasing 69.9%, 55.8%, and 65.0% compared to the control, respectively. At 80 DAT, the daily flux of N₂O emissions was 0.58, 0.56, and 0.48 mg N₂O m⁻² d⁻¹, a decrease of 54%, 55.6%, and 61.9%, respectively. The application of 2 t ha⁻¹ farmyard manure showed a significant effect at 23 DAT by 31.3% reduction from the control treatment. However, organic matter application increased N₂O emissions at 51 DAT (Table 4). The calculation of total N₂O emissions during the rice growing season with the application of this bacterial consortium had a significant effect in reducing N₂O emissions in paddy fields. These bacterial consortia (R1, R2, and R3) produced N₂O emissions lower than the control; 0.52, 0.57, and 0.53 kg ha⁻¹ season⁻¹ (Table 5).

Table 4. Daily fluxes of N₂O concentrations during the rice growing season. ^{ns}Nonsignificant, *p < 0.05; **p < 0.01; ***p < 0.001. Means followed by different letters within each group of values indicate significant differences (p < 0.05) within the same column by Tukey's test. SI5: *Amorphomonas oryzae*, OF4: *Ciceribacter* sp., TH6: *Rhodanobacter rhizosphaerae*, BD4: *Bordetella petrii*.

	N ₂ O fluxes (mg N ₂ O m ⁻² d ⁻¹)									
	9 DAT	16 DAT	23 DAT	30 DAT	37 DAT	51 DAT	58	65 DAT	72 DAT	80 DAT
Treatments							DAT			
Block										
1	1.34	1.59ª	1.57ª	0.32	0.46	0.98	1.17ª	0.99	0.48	0.78
2	1.44	0.34 ^b	0.44 ^b	0.36	0.58	0.93	1.00ª	0.44	0.33	0.62
3	1.73	1.13 ^{ab}	0.89 ^b	0.32	0.82	0.60	0.39 ^b	0.44	0.56	0.76
Bacterial consortium (R)										
R0 (without application)	1.77	0.52	1.14	0.44	0.92	1.15	1.63ª	0.93	0.61	1.26ª
R1 (SI5, OF4, BD4)	1.37	0.89	0.94	0.34	0.43	0.77	0.49 ^b	0.69	0.35	0.58 ^b
R2 (SI5, TH6, OF4)	1.66	1.06	0.97	0.30	0.56	0.86	0.72 ^b	0.32	0.41	0.56 ^b
R3 (SI5, BD4, Priestia aryabhattai)	1.21	1.06	0.82	0.26	0.57	0.54	0.57 ^b	0.54	0.47	0.48 ^b
Organic matter (O)										
O0 (without application)	1.95ª	1.02	1.15ª	0.38	0.76	0.47 ^b	0.85	0.79	0.46	0.80
O1 (2 t ha ⁻¹)	1.06 ^b	1.02	0.79 ^b	0.28	0.48	1.19ª	0.84	0.45	0.45	0.65
Pr > F										
Block	ns	*	***	ns	ns	ns	**	ns	ns	ns
Bacterial consortium (R)	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	***	ns	ns	**
Organic matter (O)	*	ns	*	ns	ns	**	ns	ns	ns	ns
R×O	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns	ns

Table 5. Yield and total CH₄, and N₂O emissions of rice cultivation.^{ns}Nonsignificant, *p < 0.05; **p < 0.01; ***p < 0.001. Means followed by different letters within each group of values indicate significant differences (p < 0.05) within the same column by Tukey's test. SI5: Amorphomonas oryzae, OF4: Ciceribacter sp., TH6: Rhodanobacter rhizosphaerae, BD4: Bordetella petrii.

Treatments	Grain yield	CH ₄ emission	N ₂ O emission
	t ha ⁻¹		eason ⁻¹
Block			
1	3.38	216 ^b	0.72ª
2	3.24	226 ^b	0.42 ^b
3	2.90	297ª	0.62ª
Bacterial consortium (R)			
R0 (without application)	3.27	270ª	0.78ª
R1 (SI5, OF4, BD4)	3.16	257 ^{ab}	0.52 ^b
R2 (SI5, TH6, OF4)	3.09	240 ^{ab}	0.57 ^b
R3 (SI5, BD4, Priestia aryabhattai)	3.15	217 ^b	0.53 ^b
Organic matter (O)			
O0 (without application)	3.13	251	0.62
O1 (2 t ha ⁻¹)	3.21	242	0.58
Pr > F			
Block	ns	•••	***
Bacterial consortium (R)	ns	••	**
Organic matter (O)	ns	ns	ns
R×O	ns	ns	ns
CV, %	12.42	19.49	28.86

On the other hand, the application of 2 t ha⁻¹ farmyard manure did not positively respond to reducing CH₄ emissions in paddy fields. This result indicated that the growth phase, both the active and maximum tillering stage (early flowering primordia of rice paddy), had a dominant effect on the total CH₄ emissions during the rice growing season. In corroboration, Habib et al. (2023) reported that CH₄ emission rates rose with the development and growth of rice plants up to flowering. It happens due to several factors, such as the good development of aerenchyma tissue and the release of more root exudates. Hence, during this phase, there is an increase in the number of tillers that play a role in the translocation of CH₄ release from the soil to the atmosphere.

Potentially increased N₂O emissions are influenced by increasing N fertilizer application in agricultural cultivation. The N fertilizer will enhance nitrification and denitrification activities and increase N₂O emissions in the soil (Kim et al., 2021). Some of the N₂O emissions in the soil can be reduced to N₂ by microbes that have N₂O reductase enzymes (encoded by the *nosZ* gene) in denitrifying bacteria (Jonassen et al., 2021). The result of the denitrification process, N₂, will remain partially trapped in the soil and will not be released into the atmosphere until the soil dries out, as in flooded paddy ecosystems. The N₂O emissions, a by-product of the denitrification mechanisms, are released through paddy plants and soil.

Based on experimental block design, the daily fluxes at 23 and 58 DAT with differences in the elevation of paddy fields affected CH_4 and N_2O emissions. Water is an essential factor in the availability of oxygen in the soil, and it will affect the methane oxidation rate and denitrification processes. The difference in the water table in the paddy fields caused the variance in water level, oxic, and anoxic conditions among the experimental blocks. The difference in land surface elevation was 20-25 cm between blocks. Block three has the lowest land surface elevation and is longer than the flooding time of other blocks. Water availability in the soil affects the methane oxidation rate by influencing the diffusiveness of methane and oxygen, and the activity of methanotrophic bacteria (Guerrero-Cruz et al., 2021). The methane oxidation process uses oxygen in aerobic conditions to activate the methane monooxygenase enzyme. Moreover, oxygen availability in the soil is crucial for the complete nitrification and denitrification process. The production and reduction of N_2O depend on the soil's spatial extent of anoxic conditions (Rohe et al., 2021).

The differences in the soil leveling affected the length of flooding at each block. The conditions increased CH₄ emissions into the atmosphere. It aligns with Wihardjaka et al. (2023), who reported that the tillage and flooding treatment influenced the CH₄ emission from the paddy, particularly the maximum tillage treatment, which resulted in higher CH₄ emissions. However, it did not significantly affect the number of tillers and plant height. The results showed that the number of tillers and plant height were not significantly different in each of the critical stages of paddy (Table 6). The number of tillers and plant height will affect the root biomass of rice plants. Yao et al. (2024) reported that root biomass indirectly affects CH₄ emissions by promoting Fe plaque formation, which accelerates CH₄ emissions from paddy soils. Root diameter, malic acid, citric acid, and succinic acid contents also significantly influenced increasing CH₄ emission fluxes (Qi et al., 2024). Root exudates also influenced microbial activity for GHG production and consumption (Chari et al., 2024).

, ,	1 ,		,					
	Nu	Imber of tillers		Plant height (cm)				
Treatments	23 DAT	58 DAT	80 DAT	23 DAT	58 DAT	80 DAT		
Bacterial consortium (R)								
R0 (without application)	11.17 ± 2.45	12.40 ± 1.68	10.85 ± 1.39	39.67 ± 2.44	82.53 ± 3.92	100.27 ± 1.33		
R1 (SI5, OF4, BD4)	11.67 ± 2.61	11.25 ± 1.56	10.60 ± 1.58	41.00 ± 2.33	81.84 ± 2.96	97.48 ± 2.29		
R2 (SI5, TH6, OF4)	10.10 ± 2.05	11.56 ± 1.76	10.46 ± 1.34	38.39 ± 1.33	78.29 ± 3.07	96.17 ± 2.64		
R3 (SI5, BD4, Priestia aryabhattai)	11.71 ± 1.92	11.75 ± 2.14	11.10 ± 1.96	40.17 ± 3.95	80.35 ± 7.36	97.04 ± 3.61		
Organic matter (O)								
O0 (without application)	10.90 ± 2.23	12.07 ± 1.58	10.61 ± 1.42	38.97 ± 2.25	79.06 ± 3.77	97.40 ± 3.17		
O1 (2 t ha ⁻¹)	11.33 ± 2.34	11.41 ± 1.88	10.40 ± 1.64	40.64 ± 2.91	82.45 ± 5.02	98.08 ± 2.67		
CV, %	6.72	5.79	2.96	20.21	14.75	14.32		

Table 6. Number of tillers and plant height at three critical growth stages of paddy. SI5: *Amorphomonas oryzae*, OF4: *Ciceribacter* sp., TH6: *Rhodanobacter rhizosphaerae*, BD4: *Bordetella petrii*.

Effect of organic matter and bacterial consortium on soil fertility improvement

The results showed that all the treatments did not significantly affect pH, C-organic, total N, N-NO₃⁻, N-NH₄⁺, available P, and K in general post-harvesting soil samples. Several factors that might be affected by this study were the application methods, dosages, timing application, and the short-term effect on the interaction between the bacteria consortium and the organic matter in the soil (Ríos-Ruiz et al., 2020). Considering this study was conducted in the first period. Nevertheless, compared to the initial soil and control treatment, the treatments could increase pH, C-organic, and total N. It was predicted due to the application of synthetic fertilizer and continuous flooding of irrigation systems. Flooding irrigation promotes anoxic conditions that trigger various bacteria populations. It also was depicted in Figure 4 that the bacteria not only inhabited the bacteria consortium and organic matter application but also on the without application treatment.

Flooded conditions enhance the number of N₂-fixing bacteria that convert atmospheric N₂ into available N for plants (Guo et al., 2023). In this specific condition, anaerobic bacteria convert NO₃⁻ to N₂O and N₂ gases by denitrification. Nitrate levels are also reduced in this process. However, it can increase other N forms, such as NH₄⁺ (Wang et al., 2021a). It also was revealed in Table 7 that N-NH₄⁺ increased compared to the initial soil. Decreasing N-NO₃⁻ in this study was depicted on R0 without applying bacterial consortium. The conditions also increase the availability of P by promoting the dissolution of colloidal Fe-bound P. This process involves the conversion of Fe³⁺ to Fe²⁺, potentially releasing P into more available forms (Maranguit et al., 2017). This modification would decrease the compound of insoluble Fe-phosphate complexes, such as FePO₄, and stimulate the available P for plants.



Figure 4. Total population of methanotrophic and denitrifying bacteria.

Treatments	pН	Organic C	Total N	Available P	Available K	N-NH4 ⁺	N-NO3-
		%		mg kg ⁻¹			
Bacterial consortium (R)							
R0 (without application)	5.71 ± 0.60	0.67 ± 0.10	0.28 ± 0.07	117.74 ± 33.04	37.81 ± 2.52	2.50 ± 0.69	7.63 ± 0.97
R1 (SI5, OF4, BD4)	5.84 ± 0.88	0.69 ± 0.16	0.30 ± 0.06	109.75 ± 16.31	37.66 ± 2.91	2.71 ± 0.84	8.86 ± 1.03
R2 (SI5, TH6, OF4)	6.35 ± 0.65	0.69 ± 0.12	0.30 ± 0.06	119.72 ± 23.72	38.83 ± 2.92	2.13 ± 0.46	9.96 ± 1.50
R3 (SI5, BD4, Priestia aryabhattai)	5.54 ± 0.81	0.73 ± 0.13	0.29 ± 0.04	116.84 ± 23.99	37.73 ± 4.71	2.37 ± 0.31	9.75 ± 1.25
Organic matter (O)							
O0 (without application)	5.70 ± 0.77	0.72 ± 0.12	0.31 ± 0.06	106.87 ± 20.03	39.13 ± 3.36	2.45 ± 0.49	8.87 ± 1.57
O1 (2 t ha ⁻¹)	6.03 ± 0.75	0.67 ± 0.12	0.29 ± 0.05	125.15 ± 24.12	36.89 ± 2.23	2.41 ± 0.73	9.23 ± 1.39
CV, %	12.97	17.46	18.73	20.35	7.93	25.02	16.19

Table 7. pH and soil nutrients after harvesting. SI5: *Amorphomonas oryzae*, OF4: *Ciceribacter* sp., TH6: *Rhodanobacter rhizosphaerae*, BD4: *Bordetella petrii*.

Waterlogged conditions also reduce soil acidity (Ding et al., 2019). In this study, the soil pH trend increased compared to the initial soil. The highest soil pH value appeared on bacterial consortium R2 and applied organic matter 2 t ha⁻¹ (O1). Besides an increase in soil pH, there was also an increase in available P content at the treatments. It is indicated that applying organic matter and bacterial consortia was well adapted to promote soil nutrients in paddy fields.

The dynamic of methanotroph and denitrifying bacteria population

The oxygen content influences methanotroph and denitrifying bacteria activities in the soil as a growth-limiting factor. The application of bacterial consortiums significantly affected the total population of methanotrophic bacteria at 23 DAT (Figure 4). The R3 application (*A. oryzae, B. petrii, P. aryabhattai*) had the highest total population of methanotrophic bacteria during the critical growth stages of paddy. It also reduced CH₄ emissions in paddy fields. It indicated the ability of the R3 bacterial consortium to reduce CH₄ emission, even though the bacterial species are not classified as groups of methanotrophic bacteria at 23 and 58 DAT (Figure 4). Kong et al. (2019) reported that organic or synthetic N, P, and K fertilizers influenced the activity and abundance of methanogenic and methanotrophic communities in paddy fields. A higher total population of methanotrophic bacteria indicated their role in methane oxidation in the soil.

The increasing denitrification activity indicated an increase in the reduction of nitrate to N_2 in the soil. However, the side effect of the resulting N_2O gas will be released into the atmosphere and cause an increase in N_2O emissions. The denitrifying bacteria could produce an N_2O reductase enzyme (Nos) to reduce N_2O emissions into the atmosphere (Jonassen et al., 2021). The results showed that bacterial consortium application (R1, R2, and R3) significantly influenced the total population of denitrifying bacteria at 23 and 58 DAT (Figure 4). On the other hand, the application of organic matter did not significantly affect the total population of denitrifying bacteria in the three critical growth stages of paddy growth.

CONCLUSIONS

The greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions reduction in rice paddy is a critical concern, especially utilizing methaneoxidizing bacteria. The application of four isolates has a positive effect in reducing CH₄ and N₂O concentration in soil incubation. *Amorphomonas oryzae* (SI5) and *Bordetella petrii* (BD4) were the best isolates at decreasing CH₄ and N₂O concentrations up to 22%, respectively, for 15 d of soil incubation. Likewise, in the observation of the critical growth stages of paddy, the bacterial consortium R3, specifically *A. oryzae, B. petrii, Priestia aryabhattai*, produced the lowest CH₄ fluxes during vegetative and early generative stages by the reduction of 17.6% and 27.1%, and the highest total population of methanotrophs. Moreover, the application of bacterial consortia R1 (SI5, *Ciceribacter* sp.), R2 (SI5, *Rhodanobacter rhizosphaerae, Ciceribacter* sp.), and R3 emitted the lowest N₂O fluxes at 58 and 80 DAT, which also affected the population of denitrifying bacteria in paddy fields. However, applying these bacterial consortiums did not significantly improve soil fertility. Thus, bacterial consortia are considered an option to reduce GHG emissions from paddy fields.

Author contribution

Conceptualization: A.W., T.A.A., A.A., S.A. Methodology: A.W., T.A.A., A.A., N.A.V., S.A., A.P., A.N.A., M.T.S., E.P., E.S.H. Software: T.A.A., N.A.V., A.W. Validation: A.W., A.A., S.A. Formal analysis: A.W., T.A.A., N.A.V. Investigation: A.W., M.T.S., T.A.A. Resources: T.A.A., A.W., A.P. Data curation: T.A.A., A.W., N.A.V., E.S.H. Writing-original draft: T.A.A., A.W., A.A., S.A., E.P., M.T.S., E.S.H., N.A.V., A.P. Writing-review & editing: A.W., T.A.A., M.T.S., N.A.V., A.N.A. Visualization: T.A.A., A.W. Supervision: A.W., A.A., S.A. Project administration: A.W., T.A.A., M.T.S. Funding acquisition: A.W., T.A.A., M.T.S. All authors reviewed the final version and approved the manuscript before submission.

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank the Indonesian Ministry of Agriculture for the financial support provided for the project. Moreover, the data and materials support were obtained thanks to the GHG laboratory of the Indonesian Agricultural Environmental Standardization Institute, Pati, Central Java.

References

- Adriany, T.A., Santoso, A.A., Akhdiya, A., Wihardjaka, A. 2021. Preliminary study of methane oxidizing bacteria isolation and selection on three rice agroecosystems. IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science 648(1):012173. doi:10.1088/1755-1315/648/1/012173.
- Chari, N.R., Tumber-Dávila, S.J., Phillips, R.P., Bauerle, T.L., Brunn, M., Hafner, B.D., et al. 2024. Estimating the global root exudate carbon flux. Biogeochemistry 167(7):895-908. doi:10.1007/s10533-024-01161-z.
- Davamani, V., Parameswari, E., Arulmani, S. 2020. Mitigation of methane gas emissions in flooded paddy soil through the utilization of methanotrophs. Science of the Total Environment 726:138570. doi:10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.138570.
- Ding, C., Du, S., Ma, Y., Li, X., Zhang, T., Wang, X. 2019. Changes in the pH of paddy soils after flooding and drainage: Modeling and validation. Geoderma 337:511-513. doi:10.1016/j.geoderma.2018.10.012.
- Gross, R., Guzman, C.A., Sebaihia, M., Martins dos Santos, V.A.P., Pieper, D.H., Koebnik, R., et. al. 2008. The missing link: *Bordetella petrii* is endowed with both the metabolic versatility of environmental bacteria and virulence traits of pathogenic Bordetellae. BMC Genomics 9:449. doi:10.1186/1471-2164-9-449.
- Guerrero-Cruz, S., Vaksmaa, A., Horn, M.A., Niemann, H., Pijuan, M., Ho, A. 2021. Methanotrophs: discoveries, environmental relevance, and a perspective on current and future applications. Frontiers in Microbiology 12:678057. doi:10.3389/fmicb.2021.678057.
- Guo, K., Yang, J., Yu, N., Luo, L., Wang, E. 2023. Biological nitrogen fixation in cereal crops: Progress, strategies, and perspectives. Plant Communications 4(2):100499. doi:10.1016/j.xplc.2022.100499.
- Gupta, K., Kumar, R., Kumar Baruah, K., Hazarika, S., Karmakar, S., Bordoloi, N. 2021. Greenhouse gas emission from rice fields: A review from Indian context. Environmental Science and Pollution Research 28:30551-30572. doi:10.1007/s11356-021-13935-1.
- Gupta, R.S., Patel, S., Saini, N., Chen, S. 2020. Robust demarcation of 17 distinct *Bacillus* species clades, proposed as novel *Bacillaceae* genera, by phylogenomics and comparative genomic analyses: Description of *Robertmurraya kyonggiensis* sp. nov. and proposal for an emended genus *Bacillus* limiting it only to the members of the *Subtilis* and *Cereus* clades of species. International Journal of Systematic and Evolutionary Microbiology 70(11):5753-5798. doi:10.1099/ijsem.0.004475.
- Habib, M.A., Islam, S.M.M., Haque, M.A., Hassan, L., Ali, M.Z., Nayak, S., et al. 2023. Effects of irrigation regimes and rice varieties on methane emissions and yield of dry season rice in Bangladesh. Soil Systems 7:41. doi:10.3390/soilsystems7020041.
- Iqbal, M.F., Zhang, Y., Kong, P., Wang, Y., Cao, K., Zhao, L., et al. 2023. High-yielding nitrate transporter cultivars also mitigate methane and nitrous oxide emissions in paddy. Frontiers in Plant Science 14:1133643. doi:10.3389/fpls.2023.1133643.
- Jonassen, K.R., Hagen, L.H., Vick, S.H.W., Arntzen, M., Eijsink, V.G.H., Frostegård, Å., et al. 2021. Nitrous oxide respiring bacteria in biogas digestates for reduced agricultural emissions. ISME Journal 16(2):580-590. doi:10.1038/s41396-021-01101-x.
- Kim, G.W., Kim, P.J., Khan, M.I., Lee, S.J. 2021. Effect of rice planting on nitrous oxide (N₂O) emission under different levels of nitrogen fertilization. Agronomy 11:217. doi:10.3390/agronomy11020217.
- Kong, D., Li, S., Jin, Y., Wu, S., Chen, J., Hu, T., et al. 2019. Linking methane emissions to methanogenic and methanotrophic communities under different fertilization strategies in rice paddies. Geoderma 347:233-243. doi:10.1016/j.geoderma.2019.04.008.
- Maranguit, D., Guillaume, T., Kuzyakov, Y. 2017. Effects of flooding on phosphorus and iron mobilization in highly weathered soils under different land-use types: Short-term effects and mechanisms. Catena 158:161-170. doi:10.1016/j.catena.2017.06.023.

- Nwokolo, N.L., Enebe, M.C. 2024. Methane production and oxidation—A review on the *pmoA* and *mcrA* genes abundance for understanding the functional potentials of the agricultural soil. Pedosphere. doi:10.1016/j.pedsph.2024.05.006.
- Pan, S.Y., He, K.H., Lin, K.T., Fan, C., Chang, C.T. 2022. Addressing nitrogenous gases from croplands toward low-emission agriculture. npj Climate and Atmospheric Science 5:43. doi:10.1038/s41612-022-00265-3.
- Pham, D.D., Hoki, A., Suhono, B., Kaku, N., Masuda, S., Takakai, F., et al. 2021. Methane and nitrous oxide emissions from paddy fields with no fertilizer use under continuous irrigation with treated municipal wastewater. Scientific Reports 11:7426. doi:10.1007/s11356-020-12328-0.
- Prakash, O., Green, S.J., Singh, P., Jasrotia, P., Kostka, J.E. 2021. Stress-related ecophysiology of members of the genus *Rhodanobacter* isolated from a mixed waste contaminated subsurface. Frontiers of Environmental Science and Engineering 15(2):23 doi:10.1007/s11783-020-1315-0.
- Pramono, A., Adriany, T.A., Al Viandari, N., Susilawati, H.L., Wihardjaka, A., Sutriadi, M.T., et al. 2024. Higher rice yield and lower greenhouse gas emissions with cattle manure amendment is achieved by alternate wetting and drying. Soil Science and Plant Nutrition 70(2):129-138. doi:10.1080/00380768.2023.2298775.
- Qi, Z., Guan, S., Zhang, Z., Du, S., Li, S., Xu, D. 2024. Effect and mechanism of root characteristics of different rice varieties on methane emissions. Agronomy 14:595. doi:10.3390/agronomy14030595.
- Ríos-Ruiz, W.F., Torres-Chávez, E.E., Torres-Delgado, J., Rojas-García, J.C., Bedmar, E.J., Valdez-Nuñez, R.A. 2020. Inoculation of bacterial consortium increases rice yield (*Oryza sativa* L.) reducing applications of nitrogen fertilizer in San Martin region, Peru. Rhizosphere 14:100200. doi:10.1016/j.rhisph.2020.100200.
- Rohe, L., Apelt, B., Vogel, H.J., Well, R., Wu, G.M., Schlüter, S. 2021. Denitrification in soil as a function of oxygen availability at the microscale. Biogeosciences 18(3):1185-1201. doi:10.5194/bg-18-1185-2021.
- Siddiqi, M.Z., Choi, G.M., Im, W.T. 2018. *Ciceribacter azotifigens* sp. nov., a nitrogen-fixing bacterium isolated from activated sludge. International Journal of Systematic and Evolutionary Microbiology 68:482-486. doi:10.1099/ijsem.0.002438.
- van Dijk, H., Kaupper, T., Bothe, C., Lee, H.J., Bodelier, P.L.E., Horn, M.A., et al. 2021. Discrepancy in exchangeable and soluble ammonium-induced effects on aerobic methane oxidation: A microcosm study of a paddy soil. Biology and Fertility of Soils 57:873-880. doi:10.1007/s00374-021-01579-9.
- Wang, C., Amon, B., Schulz, K., Mehdi, B. 2021a. Factors that influence nitrous oxide emissions from agricultural soils as well as their representation in simulation models: A review. Agronomy 11(4):770. doi:10.3390/agronomy11040770.
- Wang, S., Liu, Q., Li, J., Wang, Z. 2021b. Methane in wastewater treatment plants: Status, characteristics, and bioconversion feasibility by methane oxidizing bacteria for high value-added chemicals production and wastewater treatment. Water Research 198:117122. doi:10.1016/j.watres.2021.117122.
- Wei, M., Qiu, Q., Qian, Y., Cheng, L., Guo, A. 2016. Methane oxidation and response of *Methylobacter/Methylosarcina* methanotrophs in flooded rice soil amended with urea. Applied Soil Ecology 101:174-184. doi:10.1016/j.apsoil.2016.01.009.
- Wihardjaka, A., Harsanti, E.S., Al Viandari, N., Zu'amah, H. 2023. Effect of soil tillage and nitrogen fertilizer management on methane emission from irrigated rice fields in Central Java, Indonesia. Chilean Journal of Agricultural Research 83:347-357. doi:10.4067/S0718-58392023000300347.
- Win, E.P., Win, K.K., Bellingrath-Kimura, S.D., Oo, A.Z. 2021. Influence of rice varieties, organic manure and water management on greenhouse gas emissions from paddy rice soils. PLOS ONE 16(6):e0253755. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0253755.
- Yao, J., Xie, M., Yu, L., Liu, T., Clough, T.J., Wrage-Mönnig, N., et al. 2024. Rice root Fe plaque increases paddy soil CH₄ emissions via the promotion of electron transfer for syntrophic methanogenesis. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 191:109332. doi:10.1016/j.soilbio.2024.109332.
- Ye, J.Y., Tian, W.H., Jin, C.W. 2022. Nitrogen in plants: From nutrition to the modulation of abiotic stress adaptation. Stress Biology 2:4. doi:10.1007/s44154-021-00030-1.
- Yousuf, B., Kumar, R., Mishra, A., Jha, B. 2014. Differential distribution and abundance of diazotrophic bacterial communities across different soil niches using a gene-targeted clone library approach. FEMS Microbiology Letters 360(2):117-125. doi:10.1111/1574-6968.12593.
- Zhang, Y., Chen, Y., Penttinen, P., Quan, Y., Wen, L., Yang, M., et al. 2023. *Ciceribacter sichuanense* sp. nov., isolated from root nodules of soybean in Sichuan, China. Research Square. doi:10.21203/rs.3.rs-2935270/v1.
- Zhang, W., Sheng, R., Zhang, M., Xiong, G., Hou, H., Li, S., et al. 2018. Effects of continuous manure application on methanogenic and methanotrophic communities and methane production potentials in rice paddy soil. Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment 258:121-128. doi:10.1016/j.agee.2018.02.018.